

# Notice of Allowability

Application No.

10/540,924

Examiner

Yevgeny Valenrod

Applicant(s)

DOI ET AL.

Art Unit

1621

## -- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. ☒ This communication is responsive to remarks filed on 12/20/06.
2. ☒ The allowed claim(s) is/are 1-10.
3. ☒ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
  - a) ☒ All b) ☐ Some\* c) ☐ None of the:
    1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
    2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
    3. ☒ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* Certified copies not received: \_\_\_\_\_.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application.

**THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.**

4. ☐ A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
  5. ☐ CORRECTED DRAWINGS (as "replacement sheets") must be submitted.
    - (a) ☐ including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) attached
      - 1) ☐ hereto or 2) ☐ to Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_.
    - (b) ☐ including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_.
- Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the front (not the back) of each sheet. Replacement sheet(s) should be labeled as such in the header according to 37 CFR 1.121(d).
6. ☐ DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

### Attachment(s)

1. ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
2. ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
3. ☐ Information Disclosure Statements (PTO/SB/08), Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
4. ☐ Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit of Biological Material
5. ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application
6. ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413), Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
7. ☐ Examiner's Amendment/Comment
8. ☒ Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance
9. ☐ Other \_\_\_\_\_

THOMAS K. PAGE  
SUPERVISOR, PATENT EXAMINER  
BIOLOGY CENTER 1600

### **ALLOWANCE**

Rejection of claims 3 and 4 under 35 USC 112 2<sup>nd</sup> paragraph is withdrawn in view of applicants remarks.

Rejection of claims 1-4 under 35 USC 103(a) made over Mirabelli (US 5,037,978; '978) is withdrawn in view of applicants arguments.

### ***Reason for allowance***

Claims 1-10 are allowed

The following is an examiner's statement of reasons for allowance:

Closest art is Mirabelli ('978). Mirabelli describes a method of producing methacrylic acid ester via trans-esterification reaction. The methanol produced in the reaction is removed as azeotropic mixture with methyl methacrylate via distillation. The instant invention is directed to a method of producing methacrylic acid ester where the methanol produced in the reaction is removed via distillation. The instant invention differs from that of Mirabelli in that the distillation is performed with controlling the temperature at 3 stages of the distillation column. Applicants have provided a side-by-side comparison of their temperature-controlled method to the method in '978, where there is no attempt to control the temperature and only the temperature of the top segment of the distillation column is recorded. When the two experiments are compared the benefit of the instant invention is clear. By controlling the temperature of the lower middle and top portions of the distillation column the applicants were able to

Art Unit: 1621

significantly reduce the amount of methyl methacrylate lost to the distillation process. In Mirabellis' example (comparative example one in the specification of the instant application, p19-20) the content methyl methacrylate in the distillate was 64.7%. The claimed method reduces that content to 37.2% (see example 1, p16-17), thus reducing the loss of methyl methacrylate. Mirabelli does not control the temperature of the lower and middle parts of the distillation column and fails to realize the benefit of doing so.

Any comments considered necessary by applicant must be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee and, to avoid processing delays, should preferably accompany the issue fee. Such submissions should be clearly labeled "Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance."

### ***Conclusion***

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Yevgeny Valenrod whose telephone number is 571-272-9049. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:30am-5:00pm M-F.


If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Thurman Page can be reached on 571-272-0602. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Art Unit: 1621

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.



Yevgeny Valenrod  
Patent Examiner  
Technology Center 1600



THURMAN K. PAGE  
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER  
TECHNOLOGY CENTER 1600

Thurman Page  
Supervisory Patent Examiner  
Technology Center 1600